THE IDENTIFICATION OF STUDENTS' OBSTACLES IN READING COMPREHENSION USING GOOGLE CLASSROOM

Oleh :
Rafika Purba[1], Ersika Puspita Dani[2], Khairunnisa[3], Riska Amelia[4]
[1]Rekayasa Perangkat Lunak, STMIK Pelita Nusantara Medan
[2]Manajemen Informatika, STMIK Pelita Nusantara Medan
[3,4]Teknik Informatika, STMIK Pelita Nusantara Lubuk Pakam
[1]email: fiqapurba@gmail.com
[2]email: ersikapuspitadani@gmail.co.id
[3]email: nisa_0910ns@gmail.com
[4]email: amel_elia@gmail.com

Abstrak

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengidentifikasi hambatan dalam pemahaman bacaan yang dihadapi mahasiswa semester dua di STMIK Pelita Nusantara, untuk mengidentifikasi hambatan menggunakan Google Classroom yang dihadapi mahasiswa semester dua di STMIK Pelita Nusantara. Penelitian ini merupakan penelitian kualitatif dengan pendekatan fenomenologis. Subjek penelitian ini adalah mahasiswa semester dua di STMIK Pelita Nusantara Tahun Pelajaran 2021/2022. Teknik pengumpulan datanya adalah tes membaca. Peneliti menggunakan teknik analisis data dan penarikan kesimpulan. Peneliti menyajikan data dari kendala dalam memahami teks bahasa Inggris.

Kata kunci: Membaca, Hambatan Membaca, Teks

1. INTRODUCTION

All of countries in the world are being hit by a pandemic called Covid-19 *(coronavirus disease 2019)*, one of them is Indonesia. One of the sectors of rou- tine activity that is paralyzed is education, in the education with a very heavy bur- den the government has to decide students school from home to avoid crowds and cut the Covid-19 chain. The solution for student learning is learning through online. There are many applications that can be used to learn online at this time, namely WhatsApp, Telegram, Edmodo, Google Classroom, Zoom, Google Meet and Email. Furthermore, Means, Toyama, Murphy, Bakia, & Jones (2010: 1) explain "one class of online learning models uses asynchronous communication tools (e.g., e- mail, threaded discussion boards, newsgroups) to allow users to contribute at their convenience. The implementation of online learning is in line with technology that has developed rapidly in this era, making it easy to learn through online. UMass Faculty (2018: 5) defines online teaching and learning as "faculty-delivered in- struction via the Internet. Online instruction includes real-time (synchronous) and anytime, anywhere (asynchronous) interactions". Reading is one of the skills in English, while the skills in English are speak- ing, writing, listening and reading. Ntereke and Ramoroka (2017:1) stated that reading is the basis skill which is important to obtain knowledge for academic field. Through reading, we are able to find an information written in any kinds of form such as newspapers, text books, magazines or even map. The students activi-ty in learning was contributed a lot by reading. Some of their activity need their skill in reading, for example their leaning process. Their reading skill help them to gain their knowledge. The researcher found the problem that students had difficulty understand ing reading comprehension the text is what makes them difficult. At the time comprehending the text, students has difficulty interpreting the meaning of the text because they found some vocabularies that the students do not know, which made the students do not understand the meaning of the text. At the time in exams or quizzes if there are questions about reading the students become very difficult to do when they face the problems, if students do not understand the text given, the students will find difficulties to do the questions related the text.

Based on the Researcher experiences at STMIK Pelita Nusantara, the researcher found that some students had scores that did not reach the target when doing reading comprehension. The problem is, "What are the students' obstacle in reading comprehension using Google Classroom for second semester at STMIK Pelita Nusantara?, and The objective of the research is "to find out students' obstacle in reading comprehension using Google Classroom for second semester at STMIK Pelita Nusantara?'

2. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Reading depends on the language used because usually students form their own concepts to understand what the reading they read means so that students can better understand the reading.

Based on the explanation above, the researcher conclude that reading is one of the skills in English that must be taught to students for two reasons. The first reason, students can gain knowledge through reading and students think critically about the reading they read so that they become more thorough. The second reason, if the students are given the task of finding information it becomes a little easier be-cause they are used to reading.

2.1. Types of Reading

In reading there are types which are divided into several parts. According to Brown there are some types of reading:

- **Perspective**
- Perspective is a literary tool that functions to observe characters, events and occurrences. This perspective comes from the reader's understanding in reading a text and concludes it according to the reader's view. **Selective**

Selective reading is a reading process with the aim of ensuring a person's reading cognition is lexical, grammatical or language discourse in a very short language range.

- **Intensive**

Include among interactive reading types are stretches of language of several paragraph to one page or more in which the reader must, in a psycholinguistic sentence, interact with the text, that is reading is a process of negotiating meaning; the reader brings to the text a set of schemata for understanding it, and in take is the product of that interaction. Typical genres that lend them- selves to interactive reading are anecdotes, short narrative and descriptions,

excerpts from longer texts, questionnaires, memos, announcements, directions, recipes, an interactive task is to identify relevant features (lexical, symbolic, grammatical, and discourse) within texts of process.

- **Extensive**

Extensive reading involves learning reading texts for enjoyment and to develop general reading skill. It can be compared with intensive reading, which means reading detail with specific learning aims and tasks. Applying of texts of more than a page, up to and including professional articles, assays, tech- nical report, short stories, and books.

Based on the explanation above, the researcher concludes that the reader should know the type of reading because the reader can distinguish between his reading based on the type of text to be read.

2.2. Reading Comprehension

There are some definition about reading comprehension. According to Agustinus Suyoto (2008: 1), reading comprehension or comprehension is the abil- ity to read to understand the main ideas, important details, and all understanding. The definition tells us that reading comprehension is an activity carried out in or- der to obtain accurate information. in understanding a reading, the reader must understand the main idea of a reading and finally must understand what problems occur in the reading that is read.

Reading comprehension is a reading activity that requires a process of un- derstanding what the context is in the text. Furthermore, Durkin (2018) stated that comprehension is the process deriving meaning from connected text. It involves word knowledge (vocabulary) as well as thinking and reasoning. Therefore, com- prehension is not passive process, but an active one.

Snow (2012) reading comprehension is the simultaneous interaction that is used as written language and becomes meaning. there are three elements de- scribed by snow (2012) on reading comprehension, namely:

- A reader; the person who understand what is read.
- A text; the main material understood by the reader.
- An activity, a time-consuming process for reading passages.

Based on the explanation above, the researcher concluded that reading comprehension is an activity that takes time and drains the mind because the reader must really understand what the reading means, so that readers get what information they are looking for. In reading comprehension, the reader must focus more on the reading so as not to cause miss communication in the reading. There- fore, reading activities require process and focus. The purpose of reading is to get correct and clear information.

2.2.3. Aspect of Reading Comprehension

According to Nuttal (2018) there are four aspects of reading, which students should understand to comprehend a text well. In these four aspects, there are main ideas, specific information, inference and vocabulary, which are the four aspects that students need to be able to master reading comprehension.

- **Main Idea**

Main idea of a paragraph is one of the important things contained in the text. The main idea is also often referred to as the core of the paragraph in the text or more precisely what the author tries to tell the author what the

meaning of the text has been written. In other words, the writer wants the reader to know about it. Therefore the main idea is an important idea that the writer tries to develop throughout the paragraph.

- **Specific Information**

` Specific information is supporting information that develops a topic sen- tence by including definitions, examples, comparisons, facts, analogies, statistics, etc.

- **Inferences**

Inference is the process of finding the meaning contained in the text. When students do not

understand the meaning of one of the words in the text, they can guess what the sentence means based on the context.

- **Vocabulary**

Vocabulary is a collection of words that are used by everyone whether it is for speaking, writing or in reading. According to this statement, vocabulary is fundamental to anyone who wants to speak or anything else.

- **Obstacles of Reading Comprehension**

All general subjects have obstacles that make students slow in understand- ing these subjects, without exception the English subject specifically on reading comprehension skills. On reading comprehension, some students experience obstacles which are generally the same for each student. According to Harmer (2018) reading English text is useful for increasing students' insight knowing a few words even if the text is interesting it will make it easier for students to succeed in understanding the reading text.

Factors that influence or students obstacles in the process of reading com- prehension can originate from outside and from within the students themselves. The fact is that some of the students researcher met in senior high school had many obstacles in reading comprehension. The fact that this obstacle is obtained from the students' scores when the writer gives test questions in the form of reading comprehension.

According to Harris and Smith (2018: 227-231) stated that there are seven major factors that can affect a reader to comprehend a text. The factors divided into two categories. The first, five factors that are internal to students, namely background experience, language skills, thinking skills, affection (interests, moti- vation, attitudes, beliefs, and feelings), and reading goals. The second, includes two external factors, the nature of the text to be read and physical factors.

2.3. Google Classroom

Currently, all countries in the world are being hit by the Covid-19 pandem- ic, including Indonesia. In Indonesia, all external activities have been gradually reduced by local and central government, from working at home to studying at home. Several schools are now using online learning to support the sustainability of education in Indonesia. Each school chooses its own learning application that is convenient for teachers and students to use.

Based on the school where the researcher conducted teaching practice, they chose to use the Google Classroom application as an application that helps teach- ing and learning activities. Google Classroom is one of the applications from Google that is useful for helping teachers teach online, in Google Classroom teachers can provide assign ments, attendance list, and materials. Iftakhar (2016) stated "Google Classroom is meant to help teacher manage the creation and collection of student assignments in a paperless environment, basically leveraging the framework of Google Docs, Drive and other apps. Google Classroom allows teachers to spend more time with their students and less time on the paperwork; which is now even better" (Iftakhar 2016, 12).

According to Al-Maroof & Al-Emran (2018) Google Classroom is a newly recognized, innovative, and one of the best online platforms for learning and teaching. It was launched in 2014 by Google. Google Classroom application has been accepted by the educational community to promote the e-learning process. It integrates technology into traditional classroom. The widespread acceptance of this innovative technology has led to the emergence of literature data. Instructors can support their face to face classes with online learning through Google Class- room (Halverson, Spring, Huyett, Henrie, & Graham, 2017).

2.3.1. Advantages and Disadvantages of Google Classroom

According to Mobbs (2013), as the world is moving toward the digital age and more universities are trying to maximize the use of technology in education, one must consider both advantages and disadvantages of doing so.

The advantages of Google Classroom as follow:

- **Convenience for students**

Online learning materials can be accessed at any time. Teachers do not need students to be physically present in class and students can also save learning material from the system,

- **Lower cost**

Using Google Classroom usually saves money. Due to the way most students learn, they can choose from a variety of courses and make choices depending on their needs.

- **Up-to-date learning materials**

The learning materials system in learning using Google Classroom can be up-dated more. Their learning materials can be placed in the system. They can be updated without changing all the materials for learning.

- **Flexible way of learning**

Online learning using Google Classroom is a very flexible way of learning for many students, for example, most of the material can store so students can ac-cess them whenever they need.

- **Higher degree of freedom for students**

The online learning using Google Classroom provides the possibility for stu- dents to study the same material repeatedly until the understand.

- **Better retention**

The existence of video and audio material used in online learning makes the whole learning process more enjoyable and makes students remember things that have been learned over a long period of time. In addition, learning mate- rials can be accessed anytime the students want.

The disadvantages of Google Classroom as follow:

- **Low motivation**

Students with low motivation may not be able to achieve the set goals most of the time, because there is no face-to-face meeting which sometimes makes students feel bored of studying on their own.

- **Techonology-dependency**

Online learning materials are arranged using computer application. Affecting factors such as bad internet connection and machine failure can make the learning process take a long time.

- **Reliability of the content**

Usually the content available on the internet may now always be reliable. Sometimes there is news or content that misleads readers and produces wrong e learning materials will be available and usable for a longer time. information. So the reader must be careful when looking for information on the internet and must check the content before study.

- **Social isolation**

The extreme lack of classrooms or classmates may not be good for all stu- dents as students may feel socially isolated from not having face-to-face meetings with classmates.

In this research is qualitative research. In this research the researcher focus to analysis students' obstacles in reading comprehension using Google Classroom, Google Classroom is the application that researcher choose because when the researcher did teaching practice the application used is Google Classroom. Qualitative research was chosen to find out the problem in depth about students' obstacle toward reading comprehension using Google Classroom.

The researcher classify the findings into several points, namely students' obstacles in comprehending English reading, students' obstacles in using Google Classroom. To obtain data, the researcher used test to analyze students' obstacles in comprehending English reading. The researcher also used a questionnaire to find out students obstacles in using Google Classroom application for learning during pandemic covid-19. The subject used is limited for second semester at STMIK Pelita Nusantara.

3. FINDING AND DISCUSSION

The data were taken from 35 students from second semester at STMIK Pelita Nusantara. The researcher identified students obstacles and calculates the number of each obstacles. The researcher calculates it using the insert in table and converts it into the table.

After collected and analyzed the data, there were 216 obstacles from students in reading descriptive text. Based on the 216 obstacles are classified into several section below:

The Classification of Students' Obstacles In Reading Comprehension

No	Name	Determining main Idea	Vocabulary	Inferences	Information
1	AF	1	2	1	2
2	AI	1	1	2	3
3	AP	0	1	3	0
4	AD	3	2	1	2
5	AS	1	1	2	3
6	AD	0	0	1	1
7	AF	0	1	3	2
8	AA	1	1	2	3
9	AN	3	5	1	3
10	AN	2	4	1	3
11	CP	1	1	0	0
12	DN	0	0	1	2
13	DP	0	0	3	1
14	FA	2	1	1	2
15	FN	1	1	2	3
16	FS	2	2	2	5
17	GO	1	3	0	2
18	IS	1	1	0	0
19	MA	2	1	0	4
20	MB	1	1	0	2
21	MW	2	0	1	2
22	MF	2	2	1	4
23	MF	2	2	1	2
24	NA	1	0	0	3
25	NA	0	0	1	4
26	OF	2	2	1	2
27	PG	1	0	2	4
28	PA	3	3	2	2
29	RD	1	0	2	1
30	RA	1	3	0	2
31	SF	2	0	1	2
32	SS	2	0	1	2
33	TC	1	0	2	1
34	WA	4	1	1	4
35	YI	0	1	2	3
Total of each obstacles		**47**	**43**	**44**	**81**
Total of all Obstacles		**215**			

a. Determining Main Idea = 47

b. Understanding Vocabulary = 43

c. Making Inferences = 44

d. DetailInformation=81

The research finding, the researcher presented the results of the analysis of the data obtained during the research, there are 35 data collected by researcher. The type of test has been carried out with students is multiple choice in which one question has multiple choices, namely a, b, c, d, e. The obstacles created by these students analyzed here, the researcher will give wrong answers based on the reading obstacles category. The researcher calculates the frequency of students obstacles using the formula below:

$$P = F/N \times 100\%$$

Notes:

P= Percentage

F= Frequency of obstacles

N= Number of cases (total frequent)

Types of Obstacles, Frequency and Percentage In Reading Comprehension

No	Types of Obstacles	Frequency	Percentages
1	Determining Main Idea	47	21,9%
2	Undesrtanding Vocabulary	43	20%
3	Making Inferences	44	20,4%
4	Detail Information	81	37,7%
		215	100%

The percentage above explain the various obstacles that students encounter on reading comprehension.

1. Determining Main Idea

Based on the data above, the research explained that most students had obstacles determining the main idea of the text. The average percentage of stu- dents was 21,9%. Question model to find out the main idea of students tests can be seen below:

a. What is the main idea of the second paragraph?

(Multiple choice number 3). 14 students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"The family of Rowan Atkinson"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"The physical characteristics of Rowan Atkinson"**.

b. What is the main idea of the last paragraph?

(Multiple choice number 5). 9 students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"The family of Rowan Atkinson"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"The profile of Rowan Atkinson"**.

c. What is the main idea of paragraph one?

(Multiple choice number 12). 12 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Bees live on every continent"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Bees belong to flying insects"**.

d. What is the main idea of last paragraph?

(Multiple choice number 20). 12 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Cigarette in Kediri"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Characteristics of Kediri"**.

e. To see all the students' test questions specifically for the main idea, it can be seen in the appendix.

Understanding Vocabulary

Based on the data above, the research explained that most students had obstacles understanding vocabulary in the text. The average percentage of stu- dents was 20%. Question model to find out vocabulary of students tests can be seen below:

f. The word "thin" has the same meaning as… (multiple choice number 4).

6 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Athletic"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Skinny"**.

g. "The couple has two children, lily and Benjamin, ….." (Paragraph 3). The underlined word refers to… (Multiple choice number 6).

14 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Lily and Benjamin"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Atkinson and Sunetra Sastry"**.

h. The word "expensive" has the antonym as…. (Multiple choice number 7).

6 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"High-priced"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Cheap"**.

i. The word "trousers" has the same meaning as…. (Multiple choice number 10).

5 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Clothes"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Pants"**.

j. The word "they" refers to…. (Multiple choice number 14).

5 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Ants"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Bees"**.

k. "Those who do not work here…." (last sentence). The underlined word re-fers to….(Multiple choice number 18).

7 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"The factory workers"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"The local people"**.

To see all the students' test questions specifically for the vocabulary, it can be seen in the appendix.

2. Making Inferences

Based on the data above, the researcher explained that most students had obstacles in making inferences of the text. The average percentage of stu-dents was 20,4%. Question model to find out the inferences in student tests can be seen below:

a. What can be inferred from the first paragraph?

(Multiple choice number 8). 16 of the students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Rowan Atkinson is English comedian"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Rowan Atkinson is Mr. Bean"**.

b. What can be inferred from the last paragraph?

(Multiple choice number 15). 16 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"The smallest and the biggest bees"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Bees type"**.

c. What can be inferred from paragraph one?

(Multiple choice number 19). 12 of students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Kediri's situation"** this answer is wrong, the cor-rect answer is **"Kediri's topography"**.

3. Detail Information

Based on the data above, the researcher explained that most students had obstacles in detail information of the text. The average percentage of stu- dents was 37,7%. Question model to find out the detail information in student tests can be seen below:

a. What is the purpose of the text?

(Multiple choice number 1).

8 of the students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"To inform about Mr. Bean"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"To describe about Rowan Atkinson"**.

b. How old was Atkinson in 2000?

(Multiple choice number 2). 8 of the students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"35"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"45"**.

c. What is the most popular film from Atkinson?

(Multiple choice number 9). 14 of the students answered this question with a wrong answer, such ac

"Mr. Bean" this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Thin blue and Mr. Bean"**.

d. What is the text about?

(Multiple choice number 11). 12 of the students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Telling the habitat of the bees"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"Describing bees in general"**.

e. Which of the following sentences describes the physical appearance bees? (Multiple choice number 13).

20 of the students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"Its tongue is complex"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"It has 13 antennae"**.

f. What does the above text tell about?

(Multiple choice number 16).

9 of the students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"The history of Kediri"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"The description of Kediri"**.

g. Which one has a distinctive food?

(Multiple choice number 17).

10 of the students answered this question with a wrong answer, such as **"The traditional food"** this answer is wrong, the correct answer is **"The bean curd"**.

4. DISCUSSION

In this research, the researcher discussed the results of the research that had been carried out by the researcher, namely the students obstacles in reading com- prehension and students obstacles in using Google Classroom. The researcher found that 21,9% of students experienced obstacles in determining the main idea in reading comprehension text, there are 20% of students who also experience obstacles to understanding the vocabulary contained in the test questions, there are 20,4% of students who have obstacles in making inferences. from a reading comprehension text, and then there are 37,7% of students who experience obstacles in finding detail information in a reading comprehension text. After categorizing the students' scores, the researcher concluded that the students experienced obstacles to determining the main idea of a text, understanding the vocabulary in a text or a question, making inferences on a text, looking for detailed information on a text.

5. CONCLUSIONS

Based on research and analyzing the data, the researcher wants to conclude that reading is one of the skills that must be mastered by students. The result and discussion have been explained in chapter 4, there are 4 aspects that prevent students for reading comprehension, namely: determining idea, understanding vocabulary, making inferences, detailed infor- mation. These four aspects are what become a obstacles for students to learn read- ing

comprehension and these four aspects can make students master in reading comprehension.

Based on the research conducted, the researcher found that students' obstacles were not only in reading comprehension but in media used such as Google Classroom. During pandemic Covid-19, all schools used an online application to learn one of them is Google Classroom. The result and discussion have been ex- plained by the researcher in chapter 4, there are 4 aspects that prevent students from learning to use the Google Classroom application in second semester at STMIK Pelita Nusantara, namely: low motivation, technology-dependency, re- liability of content, and social isolation. These four aspects make students have obstacles in learning to use Google Classroom.

Suggestions

1. To the Teacher

This suggestion can be useful for English teacher Teachers must learn better and be more creative in applying reading skills teaching techniques. This is used to overcome students' obstacles in understanding the reading text. order to attract students learning motivation.

2. To School

a. In school it should be more complementary to English reading books

b. In school, it should be more facilitating technology so that students are not hampered in learning

3. To Students

a. Students should learn more vocabulary in English and learn to find de- tailed information in a textbooks.

b. Students should be more active in independent study so that they donot have obstacles when the teacher given assignments.

4. To the Researcher

The researcher analyze that this research paper is not perfect. There are lots theories or method or maybe ideas that haven't been conveyed because of the lack of skills of the researcher. And also for researcher who want to research students' obstacles toward reading comprehension using Google Classroom, it is better if the analysis uses a different aspects that researcher has done. Therefore, the researcher hopes that the researcher can use a strate- gy or method of students' obstacles toward reading comprehension using Google Classroom.

6. REFERENCES

Azhar, K. A., & Iqbal, N. (2018). *Effectiveness of Google classroom: Teachers' perceptions.* Prizren Social Science Journal, *2*(2), 52-66.

Banditvilai, C., & Cullen, R. (2018). *Problems and Obstacles in Learning English as a Foreign Language.* International Journal of Social Science and Human-ity, *8*(12).

Brown. H. Doughlas. (1987). *Principles of Language Learning and Teaching* While Plaints (New York: Longman).

Cakrawati, L. M. (2017). *Students' Perceptions on the Use of Online Learning Platform in EFL Classroom*. English Language Teaching and Technology Journal, *1*(1), 22-30

Creswell, John W. (1998). *Research Design Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitaif, and mixed.* Yogyakarta: Pustaka Belajar

Elyas, T., & Al Grigri, W. H. (2014). *Obstacles to Teaching English in Saudi Arabia Public Schools: Teachers' and Supervisors' Perceptions*. Interna- tional Journal of English Language Teaching, *2*(3(, 74-89)

Hornby. (1978). *Oxford advanced learners'.* Dictionary of Current English, USA: Oxford University.

Huda, A. (2020). *Improving Students' Reading Comprehension Through SVO (Subject Verb Object) Mapping Strategy (A Classroom Action Research) at Tenth Grade Students in SMKN 1 Kemlagi*. Language-Edu, 9(1).

Iftakhar, S. (2016). *Google classroom: What Works and How*. Journal of Educa- tion and Social Sciences, 3(1), 12-18.

Islam, M. S. (2019). *Bangladeshi University Students' Perception about Using Google Classroom for Teaching English*. Psycho-Educational Research Re- views, 57-65.

Kharisma, S. I. (2019). *The Students' Obstacles in Identify Narrative and De- scriptive Text* (Doctoral dissertation, UIN Ar-Raniry Banda Aceh).

Larasati, D. (2019). *An Analysis of Difficulties in Comprehending English Read- ing Text at the Eleventh Grade Students of MA LAB UIN-SU Medan* (Doc- toral dissertation, Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara).

Lincoln, Yvonna S & Egon G. Guba. (1985). *Naturalistic Inquiry*. California: Sage.

J. Moleong, Lexy. (2014). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. PT Remaja Rosdalarya, Bandung.

Miles, Matthew B and Huberman, A Michael. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis*, California: SAGE Publication.